

MEMO

To: City Administration/City Council

From: Mark Sollenberger /Water & Wastewater Director

Date: May 19, 2016

Re: Recommendation of bid award.

The water department has in the approved 2016 budget to repair the West Barclay (1.0mg), and Sandrock (0.6mg) Water Storage Tanks. The total budgeted amount of \$360,000.00, which includes engineering costs, in the O&M budget account #50-65-36222 is available for this project. There were three companies that submitted bids for this repair project. These bids were received and opened on May 04, 2016 at 2:00pm. All bid totals that were received substantially exceeded the budgeted funds for this project. Since the bid specifications had a provision for numerous bid line items it was decided by the staff to have SGM review the bids and pick out the bid line items that would encompass priority repairs that concern a sanitary, structural, or safety requirement and still keep the cost under the budgeted amount. The lowest bidder of the modified bid results who met all requirements of the bid specifications was Restruction Corporation with a modified bid of **\$218,957.41.**

It is my recommendation to award the modified bid for the repair of the West Barclay and Sandrock Tanks to Restruction Corporation for the total modified bid amount underlined above. SGM Engineers designed and bid this project out for the city, so I have also included their recommendation letter and both the original and modified bid tabulation sheets for your review.

Revised May 19, 2016

Via E-mail: msol@ci.craig.co.us

Mr. Mark Sollenberger
Director of Water and Wastewater
City of Craig

RE: 1.0 MG Barclay Tank Rehabilitation and 0.60 MG Sandrock Ladder Replacement Project – Contractor Recommendation

Dear Mark:

The purpose of this letter is to provide a recommendation on contractor selection for the 1.0 MG Barclay Tank Rehabilitation and 0.60 MG Sandrock Ladder Replacement Project. The project was competitively bid for four weeks and three business days with the bids due May 4, 2016. Three bids were received; the bid tabulation is attached. All three bidders acknowledged the three Addendums issued during the bidding period.

The three bids exceeded the budget allotted for the project by the City of Craig.

The low bid was received from Restruction Corporation based in Sedalia, Colorado. The original bid, not including the allowance for Bid Alternate 1, was \$403,826.36. The bid schedule included a bid alternate item for an interior floor liner replacement within the Barclay 1.0 MG tank; however, SGM performed a site visit with H&H Lining based in Grand Junction, Colorado following the bid date to review the condition of the interior liner. H&H Lining deemed the liner to be in a "repairable" condition. Therefore, the Bid Alternate will not be pursued. Bid items 16 and 17 cover the repair of the existing liner.

The highest bid was received from MMI Tank & Industrial Services based in Phoenix, Arizona. The bid, not including the allowance for Bid Alternate 1, was \$941,294.00. The bid for Bid Alternate 1 was \$267,972.00. MMI neglected to provide with their bid the required Contractor Qualifications and references.

The third and middle bid was received from Aslan Construction based in Berthoud, Colorado. The bid, not including the allowance for Bid Alternate 1, was \$696,675.00. The bid for Bid Alternate 1 was \$65,000.00. Aslan provided a Statement of Qualifications in addition to a project schedule showing work to the Barclay Tank can be accomplished prior to the July 18, 2016 substantial completion date.

SGM has reviewed the submitted bid packages and spoken with Aslan Construction and Restruction Corporation regarding reducing the scope of work to exclude interior concrete rehabilitation work to ensure the overall construction project will meet the budgeting goals for the City. The potential for reducing the total bid items was discussed in the original bid package. Bid items removed include: Items 9, 10, 11 and 15. The basis for eliminating these bid items is to avoid damaging the existing repairable liner by constructing the necessary scaffolding to complete the repairs. In addition, the overhead repairs for items 9, 10, and 11 are located above the water

I:\2013\2013-520_CityOfCraig\001_MiscEngSvcs\20 - Barclay1.0MG and Sandrock Tank Repairs\K-Bidding\BidEval\20160505 Barclay_Sandrock Contractor Recommendation_rev.docx

surface elevation and will likely remain in their current state without significant deterioration. The revised bids are \$398,625.00 and \$218,957.41 for Aslan Construction and Restruction Corporation, respectively.

SGM discussed project approach and schedule with Restruction Corporation. Restruction is comfortable with the schedule requirements and provided a revised bid form to reflect the reduced scope of work and include H&H Lining as a subcontractor for the liner repairs (Bid items 12 and 13). Please find attached Restruction Corporations Revised Bid Form totaling \$218,957.41. SGM believes Restruction Corporation is the lowest, qualified and responsive contractor.

SGM recommends the City of Craig enter into a contract with Restruction Corporation to complete the agreed upon scope of work for 1.0 MG Barclay Tank Rehabilitation and 0.60 MG Sandrock Ladder Replacement Project.

If you have any questions, please feel free to contact me at 970-384-9067.

Sincerely,
SGM



Theresa Weidmann, PE
Project Manager

Attachment: Original Bid Tabulation
Revised Bid Tabulation
Restruction Corporation Revised Bid Form
Restruction Corporation Project Schedule

Cc email: Kathy Larson, City Clerk: klarson@ci.craig.co.us



CITY OF CRAIG, BARCLAY 1.0 MG TANK REHABILITATION & 0.60 MG SANDROCK TANK LADDER REPLACEMENT

Project No. 2013-520.001-20 - Bid Date May 4, 2016 **REVISED**

Item #	Estimated Quantity	Unit	Description	Asian Construction			MMI & Industrial Services			Restruction Corporation			Max	Min	Average Unit Cost
				Unit Price	Total Price		Unit Price	Total Price		Unit Price	Total Price				
1	1	LS	Mobilization	140,000.00	140,000.00		114,159.00	114,159.00		49,547.90	49,547.90		\$140,000.00	\$49,547.90	\$101,235.63
2	25	SF	Top of Slab Deep Spall Repair	160.00	4,000.00		803.12	20,078.00		254.83	6,370.75		\$20,078.00	\$4,000.00	\$405.98
3	25	SF	Top of Slab Shallow Spall Repair	150.00	3,750.00		517.28	12,932.00		138.82	3,470.50		\$12,932.00	\$3,470.50	\$268.70
4	2,100	SF	Top of Slab Isolated Toppomg	28.00	58,800.00		51.59	108,339.00		18.96	39,816.00		\$108,339.00	\$39,816.00	\$32.85
5	1	LS	Replacement Vent and New Curb	6,000.00	6,000.00		36,979.00	36,979.00		4,516.30	4,516.30		\$36,979.00	\$4,516.30	\$15,831.77
6	1	LS	Replacement Hatch and Curb Repair	18,000.00	18,000.00		17,045.00	17,045.00		8,458.99	8,458.99		\$18,000.00	\$8,458.99	\$14,501.33
7	4,750	SF	Top of Slab Concrete Sealer	6.50	30,875.00		1.52	7,220.00		6.52	30,970.00		\$30,970.00	\$7,220.00	\$4.85
8	300	LF	Joint Repair	45.00	13,500.00		299.14	89,742.00		26.39	7,917.00		\$89,742.00	\$7,917.00	\$123.51
9	10	SF	Underside of Roof Slab Deep Spall Repair				1,442.10	14,421.00					\$14,421.00		\$1,442.10
10	550	LF	Underside of Roof Slab Crack Injection				59.04	32,472.00					\$32,472.00		\$59.04
11	1	LS	Underside of Roof Slab Reinf Chair Coating				60,291.00	60,291.00					\$60,291.00		\$60,291.00
12	290	LF	Replace Existing Liner Attachment Rail	130.00	37,700.00		69.83	20,192.70		36.24	10,509.93		\$37,700.00	\$10,509.93	\$78.82
13	200	SF	Patch Existing Floor Liner	100.00	20,000.00		38.29	7,658.00		65.33	13,065.06		\$20,000.00	\$7,658.00	\$67.87
14	1	LS	Replacement Interior SS Ladder and Safety Post	11,000.00	11,000.00		32,246.00	32,246.00		5,946.17	5,946.17		\$32,246.00	\$5,946.17	\$16,397.39
15	6,100	SF	Cementitious Coating and Exoxy Top Coat - Interior Wall				36.86	224,846.00					\$224,846.00		\$36.86
16	10	SF	Surface Prepare and Recoat Interior Piping	650.00	6,500.00		170.20	1,702.00		587.39	5,873.90		\$6,500.00	\$1,702.00	\$469.20
17	1	LS	Overflow Pipe Weir Modifications	6,000.00	6,000.00		11,940.00	11,940.00		3,590.82	3,590.82		\$11,940.00	\$3,590.82	\$7,176.94
18	3	EA	Replacement SS Overflow Pipe Supports	6,000.00	18,000.00		2,510.00	7,530.00		1,778.65	5,335.95		\$18,000.00	\$5,335.95	\$3,429.55
19	1	LS	Install New Buried Valve on Drain Line	16,000.00	16,000.00		76,379.00	76,379.00		13,453.76	13,453.76		\$76,379.00	\$13,453.76	\$35,277.59
20	1	LS	Sandrock Tank Interior Ladder Replacement	8,500.00	8,500.00		45,122.00	45,122.00		10,114.37	10,114.37		\$45,122.00	\$8,500.00	\$21,245.46
			TOTAL BASE BID:	TOTAL	398,625.00		TOTAL	941,294.00		TOTAL	218,957.41		\$941,294.00	\$218,957.41	\$580,125.70
Barclay 1.0 MG Tank Bid Alternate															
1	1	LS	Replacement Interior Floor Liner	N/A	N/A		267,972.00	267,972.00		N/A	N/A				
			TOTAL	TOTAL	398,625.00		TOTAL	1,209,266.00		TOTAL	218,957.41				



CITY OF CRAIG, BARCLAY 1.0 MG TANK REHABILITATION & 0.60 MG SANDROCK TANK LADDER REPLACEMENT

Project No. 2013-520.001-20 - Bid Date May 4, 2016

Item #	Estimated Quantity	Unit	Description	Asian Construction			MMI & Industrial Services			Restruction Corporation			Max	Min	Average Unit Cost
				Unit Price	Total Price		Unit Price	Total Price		Unit Price	Total Price				
1	1	LS	Mobilization	140,000.00	140,000.00		114,159.00	114,159.00		49,547.90	49,547.90		\$140,000.00	\$49,547.90	\$101,235.63
2	25	SF	Top of Slab Deep Spall Repair	160.00	4,000.00		803.12	20,078.00		254.83	6,370.75		\$20,078.00	\$4,000.00	\$405.98
3	25	SF	Top of Slab Shallow Spall Repair	150.00	3,750.00		517.28	12,932.00		138.82	3,470.50		\$12,932.00	\$3,470.50	\$268.70
4	2,100	SF	Top of Slab Isolated Topping	28.00	58,800.00		51.59	108,339.00		18.96	39,816.00		\$108,339.00	\$39,816.00	\$32.85
5	1	LS	Replacement Vent and New Curb	6,000.00	6,000.00		36,979.00	36,979.00		4,516.30	4,516.30		\$36,979.00	\$4,516.30	\$15,831.77
6	1	LS	Replacement Hatch and Curb Repair	18,000.00	18,000.00		17,045.00	17,045.00		8,458.99	8,458.99		\$18,000.00	\$8,458.99	\$14,501.33
7	4,750	SF	Top of Slab Concrete Sealer	6.50	30,875.00		1.52	7,220.00		6.52	30,970.00		\$30,970.00	\$7,220.00	\$4.85
8	300	LF	Joint Repair	45.00	13,500.00		299.14	89,742.00		26.39	7,917.00		\$89,742.00	\$7,917.00	\$123.51
9	10	SF	Underside of Roof Slab Deep Spall Repair	475.00	4,750.00		1,442.10	14,421.00		359.49	3,594.90		\$14,421.00	\$3,594.90	\$758.86
10	550	LF	Underside of Roof Slab Crack Injection	90.00	49,500.00		59.04	32,472.00		95.33	52,431.50		\$52,431.50	\$32,472.00	\$91.46
11	1	LS	Underside of Roof Slab Reinf Chair Coating	12,000.00	12,000.00		60,291.00	60,291.00		1,475.91	1,475.91		\$60,291.00	\$1,475.91	\$24,588.97
12	290	LF	Replace Existing Liner Attachment Rail	130.00	37,700.00		69.63	20,192.70		32.21	9,340.90		\$37,700.00	\$9,340.90	\$77.28
13	200	SF	Patch Existing Floor Liner	100.00	20,000.00		38.29	7,658.00		59.48	11,896.00		\$20,000.00	\$7,658.00	\$65.92
14	1	LS	Replacement Interior SS Ladder and Safety Post	11,000.00	11,000.00		32,246.00	32,246.00		5,946.17	5,946.17		\$32,246.00	\$5,946.17	\$16,397.39
15	6,100	SF	Cementitious Coating and Exoxy Top Coat - Interior Wall	38.00	231,800.00		36.86	224,846.00		22.36	136,396.00		\$231,800.00	\$136,396.00	\$32.41
16	10	SF	Surface Prepare and Recoat Interior Piping	650.00	6,500.00		170.20	1,702.00		587.39	5,873.90		\$6,500.00	\$1,702.00	\$469.20
17	1	LS	Overflow Pipe Weir Modifications	6,000.00	6,000.00		11,940.00	11,940.00		3,590.82	3,590.82		\$11,940.00	\$3,590.82	\$7,176.94
18	3	EA	Replacement SS Overflow Pipe Supports	6,000.00	18,000.00		2,510.00	7,530.00		1,778.65	5,335.95		\$18,000.00	\$5,335.95	\$3,429.55
19	1	LS	Install New Buried Valve on Drain Line	16,000.00	16,000.00		76,379.00	76,379.00		6,762.50	6,762.50		\$76,379.00	\$6,762.50	\$33,047.17
20	1	LS	Sandrock Tank Interior Ladder Replacement	8,500.00	8,500.00		45,122.00	45,122.00		10,114.37	10,114.37		\$45,122.00	\$8,500.00	\$21,245.46
			TOTAL BASE BID:	TOTAL	696,675.00		TOTAL	941,294.00		TOTAL	403,826.36		\$941,294.00	\$403,826.36	\$672,560.18
Barclay 1.0 MG Tank Bid Alternate															
1	1	LS	Replacement Interior Floor Liner	65,000.00	65,000.00		267,972.00	267,972.00		N/A	N/A				
			TOTAL	TOTAL	761,675.00		TOTAL	1,209,266.00		TOTAL	403,826.36		\$403,826.36		