

April 6, 2016

Via E-mail: jferree@ci.craig.co.us

Mr. Jim Ferree
City Manager
Craig, CO

RE: Lariat Lift Station Project – Contractor Recommendation

Dear Jim:

The purpose of this letter is to provide a recommendation on contractor selection for the Lariat Lift Station Project. The project was competitively bid for two weeks with the bids due on Thursday March 31, 2016. Three bids were received from the seven eligible general contractors that attended the mandatory pre-bid meeting; the bid tabulation is attached.

The lowest bid was by Mueller Construction Services, Inc. from Glenwood Springs for \$296,669.00. The project was discussed with Mueller and it was determined that increasing the size of the main lift station vault would make servicing of the lift station much easier for Craig Staff. The cost of the increase in vault size is \$1,725.00 which would make the total project cost \$298,394.00. Mueller Construction submitted a construction schedule and their insurance certificate along with project references and a plan of attack.

All of the submitted material was reviewed by SGM. The methods, approach and schedule appear to be reasonable. SGM has direct experience with Mueller on a wide variety of projects, all of which were positive experiences. Also, Mueller provided five references which were contacted by SGM, three of which were responsive. The responsive references all spoke highly of Mueller and indicated they were competent, completed project on time and within budget with minimal change orders.

SGM believes Mueller Construction Services is the lowest, qualified and responsive contractor that bid the Lariat Lift Station Project. SGM recommends the City of Craig enter into a contract with Mueller Construction Services, Inc. to complete the agreed upon scope of work for the Lariat Lift Station Project for a total project cost of \$298,394.00.

I:\2013\2013-520_CityOfCraig\001_MiscEngSvcs\07 - Lariat Lift Station\K-Bidding\Contractor Recommendation\L 20160406 Contractor Recommendation.doc

If you have any questions, please call.

Sincerely,

SGM



Chris Lehrman, PE
Project Manager

Cc email: City of Craig Staff

Attachment: Bid Tabulation
Proof of Insurance
Construction Schedule
References
Reference Responses



CITY OF CRAIG, LARIAT LIFT STATION REPLACEMENT

Project No. 2013-520.001-07 - Bid Date March 31, 2016

Item #	Estimated Quantity	Unit	Description	Mueller Construction Services			Anson Excavating & Pipe			Precision Excavating Inc			Max	Min	Average Unit Cost
				Unit Price	Total Price		Unit Price	Total Price		Unit Price	Total Price				
A	1	LS	Mobilization	20,000.00	20,000.00		14,000.00	14,000.00		44,601.24	44,601.24		\$44,601.24	\$14,000.00	\$26,200.41
B	1	LS	Lift Station	234,669.00	234,669.00		231,576.00	231,576.00		224,500.86	224,500.86		\$234,669.00	\$224,500.86	\$230,248.62
C	1	LS	Sitework	42,000.00	42,000.00		75,000.00	75,000.00		64,720.65	64,720.65		\$75,000.00	\$42,000.00	\$60,573.55
TOTAL				296,669.00	296,669.00		TOTAL	320,576.00		TOTAL	333,822.75				

ID	Task Name	Duration	Start	Finish	Total Slack	27, '16	Apr 3, '16	Apr 10, '16	Apr 17, '16	Apr 24, '16	May 1, '16	May 8, '16	May 15, '16	May 22, '16	May 29, '16	Jun 5, '16	Jun 12, '16	Jun 19, '16	Jun 26, '16	Jul 3, '16	Jul 10, '16	Jul 17, '16	Jul 24, '16	Jul 31, '16	Aug 7, '16	
1	Preliminary Matters	27 days	Thu 3/31/16	Fri 5/6/16	0 days																					
2	Start	0 days	Thu 3/31/16	Thu 3/31/16	0 days																					
3	Project Bid	1 day	Thu 3/31/16	Thu 3/31/16	0 days																					
4	Assemble preliminary data for award	7 days	Fri 4/1/16	Mon 4/11/16	0 days																					
5	Council Review, Issue Notice of Award	1 day	Tue 4/12/16	Tue 4/12/16	0 days																					
6	Contract and Bond Procurement	5 days	Wed 4/13/16	Tue 4/19/16	0 days																					
7	Issue Notice to Proceed	1 day	Wed 4/20/16	Wed 4/20/16	0 days																					
8	Critical Submittals	12 days	Thu 4/21/16	Fri 5/6/16	0 days																					
9	Procure Wet Well Submittals	1 day	Thu 4/21/16	Thu 4/21/16	0 days																					
10	Eng review and approve wet wells	3 days	Fri 4/22/16	Tue 4/26/16	0 days																					
11	Fab and deliver wet wells	8 days	Wed 4/27/16	Fri 5/6/16	0 days																					
12	Construction Phase	71 days	Thu 4/21/16	Thu 7/28/16	0 days																					
13	Mobilization & Set Up	2 days	Thu 4/21/16	Fri 4/22/16	3 days																					
14	Demolition of appertances	5 days	Mon 4/25/16	Fri 4/29/16	3 days																					
21	Install temp power for bypass	1 day	Mon 4/25/16	Mon 4/25/16	18 days																					
15	Excavation and installation of shoring	5 days	Mon 5/2/16	Fri 5/6/16	3 days																					
16	Receive & unload wet wells	1 day	Mon 5/9/16	Mon 5/9/16	0 days																					
17	Paint wet wells	2 days	Tue 5/10/16	Wed 5/11/16	0 days																					
18	Excavate and install Overflow wet well	3 days	Thu 5/12/16	Mon 5/16/16	0 days																					
19	Install temp force main	2 days	Tue 5/17/16	Wed 5/18/16	0 days																					
22	Install wye and valves on 8" main	3 days	Tue 5/17/16	Thu 5/19/16	0 days																					
20	City set up temp bypass at wet well	1 day	Thu 5/19/16	Thu 5/19/16	0 days																					
23	Commence bypass pumping	37 days	Fri 5/20/16	Mon 7/11/16	0 days																					
24	Excavate and install shoring for deep well	3 days	Fri 5/20/16	Tue 5/24/16	6 days																					
25	Install deep well	2 days	Wed 5/25/16	Thu 5/26/16	6 days																					
26	Install deep well piping and paint	3 days	Fri 5/27/16	Tue 5/31/16	16 days																					
27	Partial backfill deep well	2 days	Fri 5/27/16	Mon 5/30/16	6 days																					
34	Install new power panel	3 days	Mon 5/30/16	Wed 6/1/16	19 days																					
28	Excavate for vault	4 days	Tue 6/3/16	Fri 6/3/16	6 days																					
29	Install vault	2 days	Mon 6/6/16	Tue 6/7/16	6 days																					
30	Paint inside and out of vault	3 days	Wed 6/8/16	Fri 6/10/16	6 days																					
35	Install new power conduit to vault	2 days	Wed 6/8/16	Thu 6/9/16	15 days																					
36	Place concrete pump pad	1 day	Wed 6/8/16	Wed 6/8/16	12 days																					
31	Partial backfill vault	2 days	Mon 6/13/16	Tue 6/14/16	6 days																					
32	Install interconnecting pipes	1 day	Wed 6/15/16	Wed 6/15/16	6 days																					
33	Complete backfill and shallow pipes	2 days	Thu 6/16/16	Fri 6/17/16	6 days																					
40	Remove shoring	1 day	Mon 6/20/16	Mon 6/20/16	6 days																					
37	Receive & Set pump Skid	1 day	Mon 6/27/16	Mon 6/27/16	0 days																					
38	Install vault roof	1 day	Tue 6/28/16	Tue 6/28/16	0 days																					
39	Final backfill of vault	2 days	Wed 6/29/16	Thu 6/30/16	8 days																					
41	Install process pipe	5 days	Wed 6/29/16	Tue 7/5/16	0 days																					
42	Install new electric in vault	5 days	Wed 6/29/16	Tue 7/5/16	2 days																					
43	Paint process pipe	2 days	Wed 7/6/16	Thu 7/7/16	0 days																					
44	Start up and test lift station	2 days	Fri 7/8/16	Mon 7/11/16	0 days																					
45	Remove bypass pumping operation	1 day	Tue 7/12/16	Tue 7/12/16	0 days																					
46	Remove asphalt in parking lot	1 day	Wed 7/13/16	Wed 7/13/16	0 days																					
47	Subgrade parking lot	2 days	Thu 7/14/16	Fri 7/15/16	0 days																					
48	Install valley pan	2 days	Mon 7/18/16	Tue 7/19/16	0 days																					
49	Cure Valley Pan	5 days	Wed 7/20/16	Wed 7/26/16	0 days																					
50	Pave parking lot	1 day	Wed 7/27/16	Wed 7/27/16	0 days																					
51	Clean up	1 day	Thu 7/28/16	Thu 7/28/16	0 days																					
52	Finish	0 days	Thu 7/28/16	Thu 7/28/16	0 days																					

Project: Preliminary Lariat Lift Station Schedule
Date: Mon 4/4/16

Task Split Milestone

Summary Project Summary Inactive Task

Inactive Milestone Inactive Summary Manual Task

Duration-only Manual Summary Rollup Manual Summary

Start-only Finish-only External Tasks

External Milestone Deadline Critical

Critical Split Progress Manual Progress

Receive & Set pump Skid
Install vault roof
Final backfill of vault
Install process pipe
Install new electric in vault
Paint process pipe
Start up and test lift station
Remove bypass pumping operation
Remove asphalt in parking lot
Subgrade parking lot
Install valley pan
Cure Valley Pan
Pave parking lot
Clean up
Finish

Successfully Completed Projects

Per Section II.



Relevant Project/Contract Name: East Mesa Water Company Ditch and Tunnel Stabilization



Description of Services Provided: The contract issued was to replace damaged pipe and line an irrigation ditch that carries water to the downstream users of the ditch. The East Mesa Ditch supplies irrigation water from the Crystal River to various ranches further downstream. The ditch and supply tunnel were constructed over 100 years ago and were suffering from leaks, blowouts, and tunnel ceiling collapsing. URS Corporation, working in conjunction with the Natural Resources Conservation Service, developed a plan to remove the old pipe, install new 48" HDPE pipe (800 lineal feet), stabilize the tunnel, partially line the tunnel, and construct an intake structure. Mueller performed all excavation, pipe installation, backfill, and structures. The project occurred on a steep incline with very limited access. Mueller, working with URS Engineers for the tunnel design, developed a plan to install the pipe into the tunnel.

Overall Construction Cost, Initial Contract Value, Change Orders and Reasons for Change Orders: Original Bid \$337,048 Final Construction Cost \$392,745 Total Change Orders: \$55,697 – All change order items were owner requested, including additional pipe added to the project, the addition of the pipe to line the tunnel, and various force account items related to other portions of the ditch outside the original scope of work **Completed: May 2015**

Owner: East Mesa Water Company
977 County Road 101
Carbondale, CO 81623
Contact: Richard McIntyre – Member of the Board for the Water Company
(970) 948-9628
richard@flyingdogales.com

Engineer: URS Corporation (Now AECOM)
804 Colorado Avenue Suite 201
Glenwood Springs, CO 81601
Contact: John Sikora P.E.
970-384-4735
john.sikora@aecom.com



Relevant Project/Contract Name: Blue River Wastewater Treatment Plant Modifications



Description of Services Provided: The contract was issued to solve several state mandated requirements related to the reduction of nitrogen in the effluent. The contractor Mueller installed structural concrete for two cast in place structures, new walls in a clarifier basin, and several concrete structures inside the chlorine contact chamber to assist with installation of Ultra Violet Light Tubes. The contract also called for installation of various sizes of Ductile Iron Pipe from 30” diameter down to 6” diameter, with the majority of the pipe 16” in diameter. The contractor also installed new 6” and 12” process pumps, and removed an old clarifier and installed a new clarifier. All of the work was completed inside the existing plant while the plant was operational and without the use of a crane. Numerous pieces of pipe and equipment had weights in excess of several thousand pounds. Mueller developed a sequence of work and then worked closely with plant personnel to minimize plant disruptions. Highlights of the project consisted of moving and erecting heavy pieces of pipe and equipment without traditional hoisting while working inside the plant with limited space and access.

Overall Construction Cost, Initial Contract Value, Change Orders:

Original Bid: \$1,047,177

Final Construction Cost: \$1,071,639

Total Change Orders: \$24,462 – there were several owner requested changes such as adding additional pipe and relocating pumps, there were several changed conditions where upon excavation there were unknown pipe lines and concrete encasements that required extra work. **Completed: August 2015**

Owner: Silverthorne –Dillon Joint Authority
26452 N. Highway 9
Silverthorne, CO 80498
Contact: Jason Kruckeberg –
Operations Superintendent
(970) 468-6152
jkruckeberg@silverthorne.org

Engineer: McLaughlin Water Engineers
a Division of Merrick & Company
2420 Alcott Street
Denver, CO 80211
Contact: Jim McLaughlin P.E.
(303) 964-3333
jmclaughlin@merrick.com



Relevant Project/Contract Name: Stein Bridge and Stein Trail Improvements



Description of Services Provided: The contract issued was a proposal to resolve several issues related to the bridge and trail. The Stein Bridge is a 100 year old steel truss structure relocated over the Roaring Fork River in 1974 by the Stein Family. The bridge suffered from limited freeboard clearance during high water which impacts river rafting. In addition, the trail leading from the bridge to the Rio Grande Trail was very narrow and at very steep grades. The project consisted of raising the bridge three feet, adding new structure to hold the bridge at the new elevation, and making significant modifications to the trail. The project is inaccessible for cranes, therefore Mueller devised a method to raise the bridge without using cranes. Mueller installed structural steel and concrete, and extended the bridge approaches with heavy timber spans and decking.

Overall Construction Cost, Initial Contract Value, Change Orders and Reasons for Change Orders: Original Bid \$294,922 Final Construction Cost \$303,017 Total Change Orders: \$8,095 – Upon the demolition of the existing abutments, it was discovered that portion of the existing timber were severely rotted, which required a change order to purchase new timber members. In addition, there were restrictions placed on the travel of the Rio Grande Trail resulting in minor change order for pilot cars during travel of heavy equipment. **Completed: Spring 2016**

Owner: Pitkin County
530 E. Main St. 2nd Floor
Aspen, CO 81611
Contact: Lindsey Utter
(970) 920-5230
lindsey.utter@pitkincounty.com

Engineer: SGM, Inc.
118 West 6th, Suite 200
Glenwood Springs, CO 81601
Contact: Mike Fowler P.E.
970-384-9075 (Direct)
mikef@sgm-inc.com



Relevant Project/Contract Name: Stagecoach Dam Spillway Modification



Description of Services Provided:

Stagecoach Dam—Moltz-Mueller Joint Venture

Project consisted of removal of existing ogee spillway, forming and placing new ogee spillway raising the spillway crest 4 feet. Also included modifications to the outlet works trash rack and guides. The Stagecoach dam is a high elevation dam and work occurred while reservoir was filled. No debris was allowed to fall into reservoir or down stream.

Overall Construction Cost: \$384,884.00 **Completed:** November 2010

Owner: Upper Yampa Water Conservation District
Andy Rossi, Engineer
P.O. Box 880339
Steamboat Springs, CO 80488-0339
970-871-1035

Engineer: URS Engineers (now AECOM)
2950 Professional Pl #201,
Colorado Springs, CO 80904
Contact:
(719) 386-8300



Relevant Project/Contract Name: LEDE Dam Modifications



Description of Services Provided:

The LEDE Dam project consisted of sub contract work for the earthmoving company, constructing a structural concrete intake structure, an outlet structure and encasement of main outlet pipe, as well as spillway cutoff walls.

Overall Construction Cost: \$227,000.00 **Completed:** November 2014

Owner:

Town of Gypsum
50 Lundgren Blvd
Gypsum, CO 81637
970-524-7688

Engineers:

Zancanella and Associates, Inc.
1011 Grand Ave.
Glenwood Springs, CO 81601
Contact: Tim Beck
970-945-5700

Mueller Construction Reference Responses

1. Ditch and Tunnel Stabilization Project – East Mesa Water Company

- a. Project Type? **RESPONSE:** The project was a very difficult irrigation ditch rehab. It involved installing 800' of 48" HDPE pipe on a sheer and unstable cliff-side. It also included coordinating with a mining company to stabilize a 450' tunnel.
- b. Project Size? **RESPONSE:** Total Project Cost was \$767,000
- c. Overall Project Performance? **RESPONSE:** The project was done on budget and met its time deadline.
- d. Positive Aspects of Performance? **RESPONSE:** The project was an overwhelming success due in part to Mueller Construction's ability to deal with the many unknowns of the project.
- e. Negative Aspects of Performance? **RESPONSE:** None.
- f. Would You Hire Mueller Construction Again? **RESPONSE:** I would highly recommend Mueller Construction for any future projects pertaining to, but not limited to, the East Mesa Water Company.

2. Blue River WWTP Modifications – Silverthorne\Dillon Joint Authority

- a. Project Type? **RESPONSE:** Mueller was hired to demo and replace the running gear (collector arms) in a wastewater secondary treatment clarifier. The original design was replaced with a West-Tech design. Mueller also installed several pumps to create a BNR flow path in the plant.
- b. Project Size? **RESPONSE:** The clarifier is 50 x 50 feet, 179,000 gallon volume, 1 MGD design flow. Two smaller submersibles and two larger vertical recycle pumps were installed.
- c. Overall Project Performance? **RESPONSE:** Mueller performed very well and adapted to the conditions of the job. The clarifier is inside with no roof access, so material transportation was a challenge. The project was done on a timely fashion, with minimal delays from third parties. The pump installations went well.
- d. Positive Aspects of Performance? **RESPONSE:** Mueller worked well with JSA staff and caused no operational disruptions. The finished project is functional, works well and looks good; impressive results.
- e. Negative Aspects of Performance? **RESPONSE:** The challenges of bringing and assembling the gear inside were unexpected in planning, but Mueller rose to the occasion and performed very well, creating a positive result.
- f. Would You Hire Mueller Construction Again? **RESPONSE:** Yes! JSA would definitely look forward to working with Mueller again. When one of the recycle pump motors developed electrical noise, Mueller came in to help remove the motor so the vendor could take it to a motor shop. Mueller has an excellent customer service approach.

3. Stagecoach Dam Spillway Modifications – Upper Yampa Water Conservation District

- a. Project Type? **RESPONSE:** A partial demolition of a high hazard dam to reconstruct the spill way to a higher elevation.
- b. Project Size? **RESPONSE:** \$385,000
- c. Overall Project Performance? **RESPONSE:** Overall project performance was great.
- d. Positive Aspects of Performance? **RESPONSE:** Mueller adapted to tricky re-designs during construction, the demolition work was very detailed and had to be precise, they worked well through all unforeseen challenges and worked with a small crew who was very effective.
- e. Negative Aspects of Performance? **RESPONSE:** None.
- f. Would You Hire Mueller Construction Again? **RESPONSE:** Yes, I would hire Mueller for all my projects if I could.